

Memorandum

19 West Flagler Street ◆ Suite 220 ◆ Miami, Florida 33130 Phone: (305) 375-1946 ◆ Fax: (305) 579-2656 visit our website at www.miamidadeig.org

To:

Alberto Carvalho, Superintendent, Miami-Dade County Public Schools

From:

Christopher Mazzella, Inspector General

Date:

October 28, 2009

Subject:

OIG Final Report Re: Falsification of Overtime Hours Worked by a Former

Miami-Dade County Schools Police Department Sergeant at Campbell Drive

Middle School, Ref. IG08-51SB

Attached please find the Office of the Inspector General's (OIG) final report regarding our investigation into the allegation that Patricia Hobby, a former Miami-Dade County Schools Police Department (M-DSPD) Sergeant, had falsely claimed to have worked a substantial number of overtime hours. The OIG also received allegations that Evonne Alvarez, the Principal of Campbell Drive Middle School (Campbell Middle), had assisted Ms. Hobby in falsifying her payroll attendance worksheets.

The OIG investigation confirmed that on thirteen days during a five-month period between December 2007 and April 2008, Ms. Hobby claimed on the *Daily Payroll Sheets for Overtime Hours* that she had worked a total of 52.5 overtime hours at Campbell Middle, when, in fact, she did not actually work those hours. On one other day, Ms. Hobby was assigned and paid for a full eight-hour shift, but worked only six hours. Ms. Hobby was paid \$52.79 per hour for each of the 52.5 overtime hours and \$35.19 for two regular duty hours that she did not work, resulting in an overpayment by Miami-Dade County Public Schools (M-DCPS) to Ms. Hobby in the amount of \$2,841.85.

As a result of the OIG investigation, Ms. Hobby entered into a settlement agreement with the Miami-Dade State Attorney's Office on September 17, 2009. The agreement stipulated that Ms. Hobby resign from M-DSPD; complete 150 hours of community service within one year of the execution of the agreement; and pay \$2,841.85 to M-DCPS, the amount of her salary for the overtime hours.¹

We found that during a five-month period, Ms. Alvarez assigned 268 hours of overtime work to Ms. Hobby, although it is not clear whether these hours were first offered to the Campbell Middle home school officer, as is required by M-DSPD procedures. She received 81% of all police overtime hours available at Campbell Middle for this period. We

¹ Sgt. Hobby resigned from her employment with M-DSPD on September 21, 2009.

also found that Ms. Alvarez certified that Ms. Hobby's overtime hours were accurate, when, in fact, they were not.

In our report, we recommend that M-DCPS upgrade its procedures to monitor the request and assignment of M-DSPD officers for overtime work. As a part of that upgrade, school principals should be reminded of M-DSPD overtime procedures, including the requirement that the school's home officer be given the first opportunity to work overtime hours.

The OIG requests that we are provided with a follow-up report in 60 days regarding the adoption and implementation of our recommendations. The OIG would appreciate receiving the report on or before December 30, 2009.

Attachment

cc: Hon. Solomon C. Stinson, Chair
and Members, Miami-Dade County School Board
Walter J. Harvey, School Board Attorney
Jose Montes de Oca, Chief Auditor
Charles J. Hurley, Interim Chief, Miami-Dade County Schools Police Department
Evonne Alvarez, Principal, Campbell Drive Middle School
Patricia Hobby (under separate cover)

Final Report Re: Falsification of Overtime Hours Worked by a Former Miami-Dade County Schools Police Department Sergeant at Campbell Drive Middle School

INTRODUCTION & SYNOPSIS

The Miami-Dade County Public Schools Office of the Inspector General (OIG) began an investigation after receiving allegations that Patricia Hobby, a former Miami-Dade County Schools Police Department (M-DSPD) Sergeant, had falsely claimed to have worked a substantial number of overtime hours. The OIG also received allegations that Evonne Alvarez, the Principal of Campbell Drive Middle School (Campbell Middle), had assisted Ms. Hobby in falsifying her payroll attendance worksheets.

The OIG investigation confirmed that on thirteen days during a five-month period between December 2007 and April 2008, Ms. Hobby claimed on the *Daily Payroll Sheets for Overtime Hours* (Daily Overtime Sheets) that she had worked a total of 52.5 overtime hours at Campbell Middle, when, in fact, she did not actually work those hours. The OIG's review of documents, including Sprint/Nextel cell phone records, Sprint/Nextel cell site records, and records of Ms. Hobby's account at the South Florida Educational Federal Credit Union (credit union) revealed that on six of those thirteen days, Ms. Hobby was at or near the Miccosukee Gaming Resort (the Miccosukee Resort), rather than on duty at Campbell Middle. Nevertheless, Ms. Alvarez certified on an Overtime Payroll Attendance Roster (Overtime Payroll Roster) that the hours reflected on Ms. Hobby's Daily Overtime Sheets were accurate.

On one other day, Ms. Hobby was assigned and paid for a full eight-hour shift, but worked only six hours. Ms. Hobby was paid \$52.79 per hour for each of the 52.5 overtime hours and \$35.19 for two regular duty hours that she did not work, resulting in an overpayment by Miami-Dade County Public Schools (M-DCPS) to Ms. Hobby in the amount of \$2,841.85.

M-DSPD procedures require that the principal first offer the opportunity for overtime work to the "home" school officer regularly assigned for duty at the school. The home school officer assigned to Campbell Middle was not Ms. Hobby. The OIG investigation could not conclusively determine whether Ms. Alvarez ever offered any of the same overtime hours falsely claimed by Ms. Hobby to the Campbell Middle home school officer. Nevertheless, M-DCPS records reflect that during a five-month period between December 2007 and April 2008, Ms. Alvarez allocated a total of 268 overtime hours at Campbell Middle to Ms. Hobby—81% of all available police overtime for that period—rather than to the home school officer.

As part of the investigation, OIG Special Agents interviewed Ms. Alvarez. Ms. Alvarez stated that she was not aware of the M-DSPD overtime procedures, but acknowledged that she did not inform M-DSPD of the amount of overtime work that she allocated or

¹ Ms. Hobby declined to be interviewed.

Final Report Re: Falsification of Overtime Hours Worked by a Former Miami-Dade County Schools Police Department Sergeant at Campbell Drive Middle School

approved for Ms. Hobby during the period in question. Ms. Alvarez also acknowledged that although she did not know whether Ms. Hobby actually performed her overtime duties, she certified that the hours reflected on Ms. Hobby's Daily Overtime Sheets were accurate.

As a result of the OIG investigation, Ms. Hobby entered into a settlement agreement with the Miami-Dade State Attorney's Office (SAO) on September 17, 2009. Although the agreement did not constitute an admission of guilt by Ms. Hobby to any criminal act or any other wrongdoing, it stipulated that Ms. Hobby resign from M-DSPD; complete 150 hours of community service within one year of the execution of the agreement; and pay \$2,841.85 to M-DCPS, the amount of her salary for the overtime hours.²

While the school principal assigns overtime work to police officers for work at the school site and the principal is also responsible for certifying the payroll for such overtime work, we believe that M-DSPD should also be responsible for ensuring that its officers perform the overtime and comply with the reporting process. The OIG investigation found that M-DSPD did not properly monitor the overtime hours that Ms. Hobby claimed, or take any steps to insure that she remained at her overtime location until the end of her assignments. M-DSPD has now implemented new procedures, which require that personnel use the Computer Aided Dispatch (CAD) system to report their daily activities. M-DSPD is in the process of implementing a new system to monitor all overtime performance by its personnel.

By way of this report, the OIG recommends that M-DCPS upgrade its procedures to monitor the request and assignment of M-DSPD officers for overtime work. As a part of that upgrade, school principals should be reminded of M-DSPD overtime procedures, including the requirement that the school's home officer be given the first opportunity to work overtime hours.

OIG JURISDICTIONAL AUTHORITY

The OIG provides inspector general services to M-DCPS pursuant to the Interlocal Agreement (ILA) between Miami-Dade County and M-DCPS. The ILA for inspector general services is expressly authorized by M-DCPS School Board Rule 6GX13-8A-1.08. The scope and jurisdiction of the OIG's activities is dictated by the ILA. Among the authority, jurisdiction, responsibilities and functions conferred upon the OIG through the ILA is the authority and jurisdiction to make investigations of M-DCPS affairs, including the power to review past, present and proposed programs, accounts, records, contracts and transactions. The OIG has the power to require reports and the production of records from the M-DCPS Superintendent, School Board members, School District departments

² Ms. Hobby resigned from her employment with M-DSPD on September 21, 2009.

Final Report Re: Falsification of Overtime Hours Worked by a Former Miami-Dade County Schools Police Department Sergeant at Campbell Drive Middle School

and allied organizations, and School District officers and employees, regarding any matter within the jurisdiction of the OIG.

BACKGROUND

Campbell Drive Middle School

Campbell Middle is a middle school located at 900 N.E. 23 Avenue, Homestead, Florida. Campbell Middle educates students enrolled in the sixth through eighth grades.

Patricia Hobby

Ms. Hobby was hired by M-DSPD as a Police Officer in March 1989. She was promoted to Sergeant in August 2002. During the time period in question, Ms. Hobby was assigned to M-DSPD South Station #6, where she supervised a squad of eight police officers responsible for covering schools in the extreme south end of Miami-Dade County.

Evonne Alvarez

Ms. Alvarez was hired by M-DCPS as a teacher in February 1995. She was promoted to Principal at Campbell Middle in October 2007.

Miami-Dade County Schools Police Department Overtime Procedures

The following is an overview of the M-DSPD overtime procedures that were in place at all times relevant to the investigation:

1. Completion of Daily Overtime Sheets

According to the M-DCPS Payroll Manual (Payroll Manual), when overtime is worked at a school location by full-time employees, including police officers such as Ms. Hobby, the employees must personally note their presence by indicating the actual time the overtime started and ended on the Daily Overtime Sheets. The Daily Overtime Sheets should be placed in a central location, accessible to all employees, and completed daily. The Daily Overtime Sheets correspond to the M-DCPS bi-weekly pay periods.

2. Maintenance of the Overtime Payroll Roster

The Payroll Manual also requires that a payroll roster for each applicable pay code be prepared at the end of each pay period using the information from the daily attendance sheets. The Overtime Payroll Roster reflects the total number of overtime hours for the two-week payroll period for each employee (as stated on the Daily Overtime Sheets) and the hourly overtime pay rate for each employee. The Payroll Manual

Final Report Re: Falsification of Overtime Hours Worked by a Former Miami-Dade County Schools Police Department Sergeant at Campbell Drive Middle School

requires that the principal, or the principal's designee, verify that the Overtime Payroll Roster is accurate, sign it to certify its accuracy, and electronically approve it in the payroll computer system.

3. The Home Officer Overtime Preference

Pursuant to M-DSPD Standard Operating Procedures 3.6(a), (b), and (d), overtime requests must first be offered to the home school officer. If the home school officer declines the assignment, it can then be offered to another officer.³

4. The Computer Aided Dispatch (CAD) System

M-DSPD personnel also have access to a CAD system to report when an officer went on duty and off duty each day, as well as reporting other activities while on duty. The system can be accessed via radio, telephone or through a wireless device, such as a laptop computer. The CAD system has long been in use by M-DSPD, but personnel were not required to use it.

INVESTIGATION

This investigation was conducted in accordance with the *Principles and Standards for Offices of Inspector General* as promulgated by the Association of Inspectors General.

During the course of the investigation, OIG Special Agents reviewed documents including, but not limited to: M-DSPD personnel records, overtime procedures and reporting forms; M-DCPS personnel records; Sprint/Nextel cell phone and cell site records; and credit union records for Ms. Hobby's account. In addition, OIG Special Agents conducted interviews of witnesses, including the home school officer for Campbell Middle and Ms. Alvarez.

OIG Review of Ms. Hobby's Overtime and Regular Duty Work History

The following are brief descriptions of the instances where the OIG identified that Ms. Hobby falsified her Daily Overtime Sheets:

1. Wednesday, December 19, 2007: 2.5 Hours of Overtime Not Worked

Ms. Hobby wrote 7:00 to 12:00 on the Daily Overtime Sheet for December 19, 2007 (meaning 7:00 pm to 12:00 am). Sprint/Nextel records show that on December 19, 2007, between 9:27 pm and 10:48 pm, three calls made from her

³ We are recommending that principals be required to familiarize themselves with applicable M-DSPD overtime procedures and that such procedures be incorporated into the Payroll Manual.

Final Report Re: Falsification of Overtime Hours Worked by a Former Miami-Dade County Schools Police Department Sergeant at Campbell Drive Middle School

cell phone during that time period hit the cell tower located at 885 S.W. 177 Avenue, Miami, Florida. This tower is located on the southeast side of the intersection at S.W. 8 Street and 177 Avenue. The Miccosukee Resort is located at 500 S.W. 177 Avenue, on the northwest side of this intersection. The distance between Campbell Middle and the Miccosukee Resort is approximately 22 miles, or about 35 minutes in driving time.⁴

Two of the calls were to the credit union automated calls line, which provides account balances and enables account transfers. Credit union records show that at 9:32 pm, Ms. Hobby made a \$100 cash withdrawal from an ATM at the Miccosukee Resort.

2. Friday, December 21, 2007: 1.5 Hours of Overtime Not Worked

Ms. Hobby wrote 7:00 to 12:00 on the Daily Overtime Sheet for December 21, 2007 (meaning 7:00 pm to 12:00 am). Sprint/Nextel records show that a call was made to her cell phone that started at 8:53 pm and ended at 9:32 pm and hit the cell tower at 16200 S.W. 137 Avenue, Miami, Florida. This tower is located about 14 miles north of Campbell Middle and approximately one mile from Ms. Hobby's residence. It takes approximately 22 minutes to drive from Campbell Middle to the tower. Assuming that Ms. Hobby was initially present at Campbell Middle to start working overtime at 7:00 pm, then drove to the location where the call hit the cell tower, stayed there for the duration of the call, and then immediately drove back to Campbell Middle, she would have been away from her duty station for a minimum of 1.5 hours.

3-5. Wednesday, January 2, 2008 through Saturday, January 5, 2008: 33 Hours of Overtime Not Worked

Ms. Hobby wrote 7:00 pm to 5:00 am on the Daily Overtime Sheets for January 2, 3 and 4, 2008. Although 7:00 pm to 5:00 am constitutes a 10-hour overtime shift, the Daily Overtime Sheets erroneously reflect a total of 11 hours overtime for each of the three days.

⁴ OIG Special Agents undertook an exhaustive analysis of bank and phone records to reconstruct Ms. Hobby's presumed whereabouts at exact times during each of her falsely claimed overtime shifts. We have not attempted to reproduce the entirety of that analysis here. In fairness to Ms. Hobby, we have construed those records in the light that reflects most favorably on her. Accordingly, in OIG Table One, the "hours not worked" column identifies amounts that are at times less than the entirety of Ms. Hobby's overtime shift on a given date. As reflected in the settlement agreement, Ms. Hobby does not dispute the OIG's calculations.

Final Report Re: Falsification of Overtime Hours Worked by a Former Miami-Dade County Schools Police Department Sergeant at Campbell Drive Middle School

Maintenance records, records from a private security company, and interviews conducted by OIG Special Agents confirm that on the first two of the three dates in question, M-DCPS had arranged for a private security guard to provide overnight security for an outside door under repair at Campbell Middle. M-DCPS officials informed Ms. Alvarez that a private security guard was providing the security for the door, so that no M-DSPD officer was needed. The private security guard on duty stated under oath that he guarded the door for two shifts at Campbell Middle (from 4:00 pm on January 2, 2008, to 8:00 am on January 3, 2008, and from 4:00 pm on January 3, 2008, to 8:00 am on January 4, 2008) and never saw Ms. Hobby at any time during those hours.

Sprint/Nextel records show that on January 3, 2008, between 7:54 pm and 9:37 pm, three calls were made to or from Ms. Hobby's cell phone that hit the tower near her home. Credit union records show that on January 4, 2008, at 6:56 pm, Ms. Hobby withdrew \$400 cash from an ATM at the Miccosukee Resort. Sprint/Nextel records show that beginning on January 4 at 7:30 pm, and continuing until January 5, 2008 at 5:18 am, 13 calls were made to or from Ms. Hobby's cell phone that hit the tower at the intersection across from the Miccosukee Resort.

6. Thursday, January 10, 2008: 2 hours of Overtime Not Worked

Ms. Hobby wrote 5:00 to 8:00 on the Daily Overtime Sheet for January 10, 2008 (meaning 5:00 pm to 8:00 pm). Sprint/Nextel records show that on January 10, 2008, between 6:17 pm and 7:20 pm, five calls were made to or from Ms. Hobby's cell phone that hit cell towers located about 14 to 22 miles progressively north of Campbell Middle. The last three calls hit the tower at the intersection across from the Miccosukee Resort, indicating that Ms. Hobby was moving farther and farther north of Campbell Middle while the calls were made. The driving time from Campbell Middle to the first tower is approximately 22 minutes, and the driving time from the last tower to Campbell Middle is approximately 35 minutes.

7. Monday, January 14, 2008: 2 Hours of Overtime Not Worked

Ms. Hobby wrote 3:00 to 5:00 on the Daily Overtime Sheet for January 14, 2008 (meaning 3:00 pm to 5:00 pm). Sprint/Nextel records show that on January 14, 2008, between 3:23 pm and 4:54 pm, eight calls were made to or from Ms. Hobby's cell phone that hit cell towers indicating a pattern of Ms. Hobby moving about 13 miles north of Campbell Middle, then moving south to about seven miles north of Campbell Middle, and thereafter moving north again until the last three calls hit the tower at the intersection across from the Miccosukee Resort. The

Final Report Re: Falsification of Overtime Hours Worked by a Former Miami-Dade County Schools Police Department Sergeant at Campbell Drive Middle School

driving time from Campbell Middle to the first tower is approximately 15 minutes.

8. Tuesday, February 5, 2008: 2 Hours of Regular Duty Not Worked

M-DSPD personnel prepares a "Strength Report" each day to show the names, duty status, and shifts worked by each officer at a particular work location for each day during their regular duty hours. The M-DSPD Station 6 Strength Report for February 5, 2008 reflects that Ms. Hobby was on duty from 7:00 am until 3:00 pm on this date. M-DCPS records show that she was paid her regular duty hourly pay rate for the entire eight hours on this date.

Credit union records show that on February 5, 2008, at 12:40 pm and 1:01 pm, Ms. Hobby made two cash withdrawals totaling \$400 from ATMs located at the Miccosukee Resort. In addition, Sprint/Nextel records show that between 12:14 pm and 2:29 pm during that shift, numerous calls on Ms. Hobby's cell phone hit the cell tower at the intersection across from the Miccosukee Resort.

9. Friday, February 8, 2008: 2 Hours of Overtime Not Worked

Ms. Hobby wrote 3:00 to 9:00 on the Daily Overtime Sheet for February 8, 2008 (meaning 3:00 pm to 9:00 pm). Sprint/Nextel records show that on February 8, 2008, between 6:00 pm and 7:29 pm, five calls were made to or from Ms. Hobby's cell phone that hit cell towers between 9 and 17 miles from Campbell Middle, indicating Ms. Hobby's movement to the north and east of Campbell Middle during that time. The driving time from Campbell Middle to the first tower, and from the last tower back to Campbell Middle, is approximately 30 minutes.

10. Monday, March 17, 2008: 2 Hours of Overtime Not Worked

Ms. Hobby wrote 3:00 to 5:00 on the Daily Overtime Sheet for March 17, 2008 (meaning 3:00 pm to 5:00 pm). Sprint/Nextel records show that on March 17, 2008, between 2:59 pm and 4:48 pm, three calls were made to or from Ms. Hobby's cell phone that hit cell towers 18 to 22 miles from Campbell Middle, the last of which was the tower at the intersection across from the Miccosukee Resort. In addition, credit union records show that at 4:50 pm, Ms. Hobby made a \$20 cash withdrawal from an ATM at the Miccosukee Resort.

Final Report Re: Falsification of Overtime Hours Worked by a Former Miami-Dade County Schools Police Department Sergeant at Campbell Drive Middle School

11. Wednesday, April 9, 2008: 1 Hour of Overtime Not Worked

Ms. Hobby wrote 3:00 to 5:00 on the Daily Overtime Sheet for April 9, 2008 (meaning 3:00 pm to 5:00 pm). Sprint/Nextel records show that on April 9, 2008, between 3:26 pm and 4:03 pm, three calls were made to or from Ms. Hobby's cell phone that hit cell towers located about 14 to 19 miles from Campbell Middle. The driving time from Campbell Middle to the first tower, and from the last tower back to Campbell Middle, is approximately 30 minutes.

12. Tuesday, April 15, 2008: 1.5 Hours of Overtime Not Worked

Ms. Hobby wrote 3:00 to 8:00 on the Daily Overtime Sheet for April 15, 2008 (meaning 3:00 pm to 8:00 pm). Sprint/Nextel records show that on April 15, 2008, between 5:20 pm and 6:39 pm, eight calls were made to or from Ms. Hobby's cell phone that hit the cell towers located about 9 to 14 miles north of Campbell Middle. The driving time from Campbell Middle to the first tower, and from the last tower back to Campbell Middle, is approximately 30 minutes.

13. Wednesday, April 16, 2008: 2 Hours of Overtime Not Worked

Ms. Hobby wrote 3:00 to 5:00 on the Daily Overtime Sheet for April 16, 2008 (meaning 3:00 pm to 5:00 pm). Sprint/Nextel records show that on April 16, 2008, between 2:59 pm and 4:27 pm, 11 calls were made to or from Ms. Hobby's cell phone that hit cell towers located about 14 to 19 miles north of Campbell Middle. The driving time from Campbell Middle to the first tower, and from the last tower back to Campbell Middle, is approximately 30 minutes.

14. Tuesday, April 22, 2008: 3 Hours of Overtime Not Worked

Ms. Hobby wrote 3:00 to 7:00 on the Daily Overtime Sheet for April 22, 2008 (meaning 3:00 pm to 7:00 pm). Sprint/Nextel records show that on April 22, 2008, between 3:48 pm and 6:52 pm, 10 calls were made to or from Ms. Hobby's cell phone that hit cell towers located about 14 to 22 miles north of Campbell Middle, including eight calls that hit the tower at the intersection across from the Miccosukee Resort. In addition, credit union records show that at 4:04 pm, Ms. Hobby withdrew \$400 cash from an ATM at the Miccosukee Resort.

As reflected in the table on the next page, Ms. Hobby falsified her records to receive almost \$3,000 in overtime pay.

Final Report Re: Falsification of Overtime Hours Worked by a Former Miami-Dade County Schools Police Department Sergeant at Campbell Drive Middle School

OIG TABLE ONE

INCIDENT	DATE	PAY TYPE	HOURLY PAY RATE	HOURS CLAIMED AND PAID	GROSS AMOUNT PAID	HOURS NOT WORKED	AMOUNT OF OVERPAYMENT
1	12/19/2007	OVERTIME	\$52.79	5	\$263.95	2.5	\$131.98
2	12/21/2007	OVERTIME	\$52.79	5	\$263.95	1.5	\$79.18
3	1/2/2008	OVERTIME	\$52.79	11	\$580.69	11	\$580.69
4	1/3/2008	OVERTIME	\$52.79	11	\$580.69	11	\$580.69
5	1/4/2008	OVERTIME	\$52.79	11	\$580.69	11	\$580.69
6	1/10/2008	OVERTIME	\$52.79	3	\$158.37	2	\$105.58
7	1/14/2008	OVERTIME	\$52.79	2	\$105.58	2	\$105.58
8	2/5/2008	REGULAR	\$35.19	8	\$281.52	2	\$70.38
9	2/8/2008	OVERTIME	\$52.79	6	\$316.74	2	\$105.58
10	3/17/2008	OVERTIME	\$52.79	2	\$105.58	2	\$105.58
11	4/9/2008	OVERTIME	\$52.79	2	\$105.58	1	\$52.79
12	4/15/2008	OVERTIME	\$52.79	3	\$158.37	1.5	\$79.18
13	4/16/2008	OVERTIME	\$52.79	2	\$105.58	2	\$105.58
14	4/22/2008	OVERTIME	\$52.79	4	\$211.16	3	\$158.37
TOTALS		8		75	\$3,818.45	54.5	\$2,841.85

Interviews of Campbell Middle's Home School Officer

As part of the investigation, OIG Special Agents interviewed the home school officer assigned to Campbell Middle. He confirmed that M-DSPD procedures required that overtime requests are to be offered first to the home school officer. However, the home school officer stated that he did not recall Ms. Alvarez or her designee offering him any of the 25 overtime hours at

Final Report Re: Falsification of Overtime Hours Worked by a Former Miami-Dade County Schools Police Department Sergeant at Campbell Drive Middle School

Campbell Middle claimed by Ms. Hobby for five nights in mid-December 2007, or any of the 33 overtime hours at Campbell Middle claimed by Ms. Hobby for three nights in early January 2008.⁵

Interview of Principal Evonne Alvarez

Ms. Alvarez was interviewed by OIG Special Agents on three separate occasions. Ms. Alvarez stated that she was not aware of the M-DSPD overtime procedures, but acknowledged that she did not inform M-DSPD of the amount of overtime work that she allocated or approved for Ms. Hobby during the period in question. Ms. Alvarez acknowledged that although she did not know whether Ms. Hobby actually performed her overtime duties, she certified that the hours reflected on the Overtime Payroll Roster were accurate. Ms. Alvarez also stated that she had never maintained a personal friendship with Ms. Hobby outside of work.

Ms. Alvarez initially stated that Ms. Hobby was needed to work overtime at Campbell Middle between 7:00 pm and 12:00 am on five nights in mid-December 2007 due to certain maintenance work being done at the school. However, after she was shown M-DCPS maintenance records revealing that such maintenance work was not performed at Campbell Middle on those nights, Ms. Alvarez then stated that Ms. Hobby was needed on those nights because of vandalism that was occurring at the school around that time.⁶

Ms. Alvarez also stated that Ms. Hobby was needed at the school in early January 2008 because the outside door between the cafeteria and the parking lot was under repair and, thus, not secure. Thereafter, OIG Special Agents discovered that M-DCPS had arranged for a private security guard to provide security for the door, so that no M-DSPD personnel were needed. OIG Special Agents also discovered that M-DCPS supervisory personnel had informed Ms. Alvarez at the time that no M-DSPD personnel were needed to guard the door.

OIG Special Agents then questioned Ms. Alvarez further about the issue. In contrast to her earlier statement, Ms. Alvarez responded that she had wanted an armed M-DSPD officer to guard the door for deterrent purposes during nighttime hours.

The Settlement Agreement

As a result of the OIG investigation, Ms. Hobby entered into a settlement agreement with the

⁵ In her discretionary response to the draft copy of this report, Ms. Alvarez stated that she (and/or her designee) first offered the overtime hours to the home school officer, who declined them. OIG Special Agents then re-interviewed the home school officer. As more fully described below, the home school officer was less sure of his version of the events.

⁶ Ms. Alvarez changed her explanation as to the need for an overtime M-DSPD officer immediately after examining the maintenance records. However, the investigation did confirm incidences of vandalism at Campbell Middle in early January 2008.

Final Report Re: Falsification of Overtime Hours Worked by a Former Miami-Dade County Schools Police Department Sergeant at Campbell Drive Middle School

SAO on September 17, 2009. Although the agreement did not constitute an admission of guilt by Ms. Hobby to any criminal act or any other wrongdoing, it requires that:

- Ms. Hobby resign from M-DSPD;
- Ms. Hobby complete 150 hours of community service within one year of the execution of the agreement; and
- Ms. Hobby pay \$2,841.85 to M-DCPS, the amount of her salary for the overtime hours.

RESPONSE TO THE DRAFT REPORT & OIG COMMENT

This report, in draft version, was provided to Ms. Hobby, Ms. Alvarez, the Miami-Dade County Schools Police Department, and the Miami-Dade County Public Schools Office of the Superintendent for their discretionary written responses. The OIG only received a response from Ms. Alvarez, which is attached as Appendix A. We appreciate Ms. Alvarez' response.

Ms. Alvarez stated that she or her designee had, in fact, first offered the overtime hours to the Campbell Middle home school officer, who declined them. As a result, OIG Special Agents then re-interviewed the home school officer. The home school officer stated that he believed that he would have accepted the overtime assignments if anyone had offered them to him. However, he also admitted that he could not recall with certainty whether he had not been offered the assignments.

Ms. Alvarez denied that OIG Special Agents had previously shown her M-DCPS maintenance records, although her response did not clearly state whether she was referring to the maintenance work not performed at Campbell Middle in mid-December 2007, or the door repairs actually performed in early January 2008. Ms. Alvarez also complained that the Campbell Middle head custodian had been interviewed about the door repairs by OIG Special Agents, but that his interview was not highlighted in the draft report.⁷

In the balance of her response, Ms. Alvarez provided examples of vandalism that had occurred at Campbell Middle during the time period in question. She also reiterated that she is an M-DCPS employee, and as such, followed M-DCPS rules regarding overtime hiring procedures. We note that our following recommendations are intended, in part, to eliminate any confusion or discrepancies that currently exist when M-DCPS officials request the assignment of M-DSPD officers for overtime work.

⁷ In fact, the head custodian confirmed that the door repairs were performed in January 2008. He also stated that he observed a private security guard present during the repairs. Finally, he stated that he did not see either Ms. Hobby or any other M-DSPD officer present at that time.

Final Report Re: Falsification of Overtime Hours Worked by a Former Miami-Dade County Schools Police Department Sergeant at Campbell Drive Middle School

CONCLUSIONS, RECOMMENDATIONS & REQUESTED FOLLOW-UP

The OIG investigation determined that Ms. Hobby falsely claimed over 50 hours of overtime. She has since entered into a settlement agreement that requires her to resign her position and re-pay the School Board \$2,841.85 as restitution. We found that Ms. Hobby received 81% of all police overtime hours available at Campbell Middle during a five-month period. We also found that Ms. Alvarez certified that Ms. Hobby's overtime hours were accurate, when, in fact, they were not.

While the school principal assigns overtime work to police officers for work at the school site and the principal is also responsible for certifying the payroll for such overtime work, we believe that M-DSPD should also be responsible for ensuring that its officers perform the overtime and comply with the reporting process. We are encouraged by recent M-DSPD actions of implementing a new system to monitor all overtime performance by its personnel.

By way of this report, the OIG recommends:

- That M-DCPS upgrade its procedures to monitor the request and assignment of M-DSPD officers for overtime work. The procedures should, at a minimum, include documentation of the following:
 - a. The date, time, and reason for the overtime assignment.
 - b. The identification of the home school officer, and a certification that the home school officer was first offered the overtime assignment. If the home school officer was not offered the assignment, notate the reason(s) the assignment was offered to another officer.
 - c. The documentation should be prepared, approved and signed by the person requesting the overtime, and then reviewed, approved and signed by the assigned officer's immediate supervisor.
- That principals, and any other individuals authorized to assign overtime hours to M-DSPD personnel, be required to familiarize themselves with applicable M-DSPD overtime procedures and that such procedures be incorporated into the Payroll Manual.

The OIG requests that we are provided with a follow-up report in 60 days regarding the adoption and implementation of our recommendations. The OIG would appreciate receiving the report on or before December 30, 2009.

Miami-Dade County Public Schools Office of the Inspector General

APPENDIX A

Response from Evonne Alvarez
Principal of Campbell Drive Middle School

IG08-51SB

In Response to Miami-Dade County Office of the Inspector General Ref: IG08-515B By Evonne Alvarez, Principal Campbell Drive Middle School

Page 1 of 12: This administrator is an employee of Miami-Dade County Public Schools (MDCPS) not Miami-Dade School Police Department (MDSPD). The appropriate overtime hiring procedures in place for MDCPS were followed to hire employees at the school site. MDCPS policy states that overtime hours are distributed by the principal to support the instructional program and provide safety for all students and staff. As stated on page 2 of 12, MDSPD is in the process of implementing a new system to monitor all overtime performance of its' personnel.

Page 4 of 12: Furthermore, pursuant to MDSPD standard operating procedures 3.6 (a), (b), (d); Officer Michael Drury was offered overtime hours at the school site by the administrator and my designee. Officer Drury declined overtime hours in the presence of other administrators stating that his family and personal situation at the time was a difficult one due to the adoption of his child. His direct supervisor Seargent Patricia Hobby was then offered the hours he declined.

Page 10 of 12: This administrator was not shown any maintenance records by the IG. This administrator provided maintenance documents provided by Maintenance and Facilities. Custodial staff was also paid overtime during days noted. The unarmed security hired by MDCPS Maintenance was a previous employee, security monitor at Campbell Drive Middle School. The school did remain without a door, entrance to cafeteria on two occasions during these days. The head custodian at the time who witnessed this was interviewed by the IG but his statements are not referenced in this document.

Page 11 of 12: Referenced footnote number 5. All documents were provided to the IG by this administrator as requested. Statistics for the 07-08 school year indicated serious incidents and student arrests averaged a frequency of 8 to 10 times a month. Additionally, Campbell Drive Middle School was cited as the most violent middle school in the state of Florida for the 05-06 and 06-07 school year according to the most recent data available. There were multiply incidents of violence and vandalism during the months of November, December of 2007 as well as January of 2008. This administrator requested in writing additionally assistance from the chief of police of MDSPD at the time.